

UNCLASSIFIED

FLYING CATEGORY

TRAINING SUBCATEGORY DESCRIPTION

The primary purpose of bases in this subcategory is to produce pilots. Important attributes required by the bases in this subcategory are:

- Three parallel runways
- Good flying weather
- Extended daylight hours
- Extensive airspace between 5,000 and 40,000 feet with relatively unrestricted access
- A nearby auxiliary airfield for high volume T-37 operations
- Minimum encroachment
- Adequate alternate airfields/instrument training facilities
- Available adequate low level training routes

Bases in this subcategory are:

Columbus AFB, Mississippi
Laughlin AFB, Texas
Reese AFB, Texas
Vance AFB, Oklahoma
Williams AFB, Arizona

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

FLYING CATEGORY

TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CAPACITY ANALYSIS

The current combined maximum production capacity of the primary undergraduate pilot training (UPT) bases is approximately 1,900 pilots per year. Additionally, the EURO NATO Joint Jet Pilot Training Program at Sheppard AFB, Texas produces approximately 110 U.S. Air Force pilots per year.

The force structure reflected in the DoD Force Structure Plan significantly reduces the total force pilot requirement. The Air Force determined that there was sufficient excess pilot production capacity to warrant the closure of a UPT base and still retain surge capacity.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

WILLIAMS AIR FORCE BASE

Recommendation: Williams Air Force Base, Arizona, is recommended for closure. All aircraft will be retired or redistributed. The 82nd Flying Training Wing will inactivate. Major tenant unit relocating is: Aircrew Training Research Facility to Orlando, Florida. All other personnel will depart.

Justification: The Air Force has one more Training subcategory base than needed to support reduced Air Force force structure. All Training subcategory bases were considered for closure equally in a process that conformed to the Defense Base Closure and Realignment Act of 1990 and the Office of Secretary of Defense (OSD) guidance. Each base was evaluated against the eight DoD selection criteria and a large number of subelements specific to Air Force bases and missions. The selection process involved the evaluation of a large number of subelements of the criteria by the Base Closure Executive Group (BCEG), a group of five general officers and five senior civilians appointed by the Secretary of the Air Force. The decision to close Williams Air Force Base was made by the Secretary of the Air Force with advice of the Air Force Chief of Staff and in consultation with the BCEG.

As with the other categories, it was difficult to select closure candidates. All Training subcategory bases are in generally good condition with strong community support. Distinctions can be drawn, however, when the data are evaluated against all eight of the DoD selection criteria and Air Force subelements. Williams Air Force Base ranked low in this process and is recommended for closure. While Williams Air Force Base's ranking rests on the combined results of applying the eight DoD selection criteria, rather than one or two specific deficiencies, a few points stand out. Williams AFB ranked lowest in its category for airspace encroachment both now and in the future, directly impacting its long term military value. Additionally, it ranked lowest in condition of base facilities. The cost to close Williams Air Force Base is low and savings are favorable.

The closure of Williams Air Force Base will have an impact on the local economy, however it is the least severe of any of the Training subcategory bases. It is projected to result in a population loss of approximately 7,700 persons, direct and indirect employment loss of nearly 6,000 jobs, and regional income loss of nearly 130 million dollars. These losses are in contrast to a regional population of just over 2,000,000, available jobs of nearly 1,200,000, and regional annual income of nearly 33 billion dollars. Williams Air Force Base is on the Environmental Protection Agency's National Priorities List.

By the end of FY 97, the net saving of implementing this recommendation is about \$268M. Annual savings after implementation are expected to be \$69.4M. All values are in TY\$.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

FLYING CATEGORY

TRAINING SUBCATEGORY

SPECIFIC ACTIONS/IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

Williams AFB, Arizona

Unit

Disposition

82nd Flying Training Wing	Inactivates
Aircrew Training Research Facility	Relocates to Orlando, Florida

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

**FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY
CRITERIA**

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

I. CURRENT AND FUTURE MISSION REQUIREMENTS AND THE IMPACT ON OPERATIONAL READINESS OF DOD

<u>CLOSURE RATING (G.Y.R)</u>	
GREEN - Force structure is a key part of the force structure plan - no programmed reductions	
YELLOW - Force structure is an integral part of the force structure plan - but has programmed reductions	
RED - Force structure is being phased out in the force structure plan	
1. Is existing force structure for primary mission of the base remaining in the inventory?	
2. Operational effectiveness	
A. Three parallel runways	GREEN - 3 or more; YELLOW - 2; RED - < 2
B. Geographic location supports mission	
(1) Time to Alternate Base:	GREEN - < 15 min; YELLOW < 20 min; RED > 20 min
(2) Adequate Local Low Level Training Routes	GREEN - 3 or more; YELLOW - 2; RED - < 2
(3) Auxiliary fields	
a. Flight time	GREEN < 12 min; YELLOW < 18 min; RED > 18 min
b. Air Force Own or lease Auxiliary Fields	GREEN - Own RED - Lease
C. Average time to MOAs	GREEN - < 15 min to area YELLOW - 15 to 20 min to area RED - > 20 min to area
D. Weather	
(1) Percent of days at or above 3000ft/3mi	GREEN - > 85% YELLOW - 76% to 84% RED - < 75%
(2) Sortie attrition rate due to weather	GREEN - < 21 percent YELLOW - 22 to 30 percent RED - > 30 percent

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

3. If there is force structure to support other categories at the base, will they remain in the inventory?

GREEN - Force structure is a key part of the force structure plan
no programmed reductions

YELLOW - Force structure is an integral part of the force structure plan - but has
programmed reductions

RED - No force structure or is being phased out in the force structure plan

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

I. IMPACT ON OPERATIONAL READINESS

	FS	R/Ws	Alt Bas	LLTRs	AUX FLD Time	Own	MOAs	WEATHER 3000/3	Attrit	Other FS
COLUMBUS	Y	G	G	G	G	G	G	Y	Y	R
LAUGHLIN	Y	G	Y	G	G	G	G	Y	G	R*
REESE	Y	G	G	G	G	G	G	G	Y	R
VANCE	Y	G	G	G	G	G	G	Y	Y	R
WILLIAMS	Y	G	G	G	G	R	G	G	G	R

* Supports Drug Interdiction Operations

FS (Force Structure) - GREEN = no programmed reductions; YELLOW = programmed reductions; RED = being phased out

R/Ws (Three parallel runways) - GREEN = 3 or more; YELLOW = 2; RED = < 2

Alt Bas (Time to Alternate Base) - GREEN = < 15 min; YELLOW = < 20 min; RED = > 20 min

LLTRs (Adequate Low Level Training Routes) - GREEN = 3 or more; YELLOW = 2; RED = < 2

AUX FLD (Auxiliary Fields)

Time - GREEN = < 12 min; YELLOW = < 18 min; RED = > 18 min

Own - GREEN = AF owns; RED = AF leases

MOAs (Average time to MOAs) - GREEN = < 12 min; YELLOW = < 18 min; RED = > 18 min

WEATHER: 3000/3 (Percent of days at or above 3000ft/3mi) - GREEN = > 85 percent; YELLOW = 76 to 85 percent; RED = < 75 percent

ATTRIT (Sortie Attrition due to weather) - GREEN = 21 percent or less; YELLOW = 22 to 30 percent; RED = > 30 percent

Other FS (Base has force structure to support other categories) - GREEN = Yes with no programmed reductions; YELLOW = Yes, but has programmed reductions; RED = No or it is being phased out

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

II. AVAILABILITY AND CONDITION OF LAND, FACILITIES, AND ASSOCIATED AIRSPACE AT BOTH THE EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING LOCATIONS

1. Are there unique facilities at the installation which must be replicated if the base is closed? (High cost specialized facilities)

GREEN - Yes, unique facilities exists
RED - No unique facilities exists

2A. Existing Associated Airspace encroachment (special use airspace)

MOAs and Restricted Airspace

GREEN - Civil and commercial aviation development generally compatible with existing military operating areas and restricted airspace
YELLOW - Civil and commercial aviation development impacts access to some (limited) MOAs. Near-term development of MOAs or restricted airspace may be limited
RED - Civil and commercial aviation dominates the development of, and access to MOAs. Near-term development of MOAs or restricted airspace incompatible

Auxiliary Airfields

GREEN - Regional development generally compatible with Auxiliary Airfields use
YELLOW - Regional development incompatible in some (limited) areas, creating some restrictions on Auxiliary Airfield use
RED - Regional development severely incompatible in many areas, causing major modifications or severely limit access to Auxiliary Airfields

Low Level Routes

GREEN - Regional development generally compatible with low level route access
YELLOW - Regional development incompatible in some (limited) areas, creating restrictions on low level route structure
RED - Regional development severely incompatible in many areas, causing major modifications to low level routes

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

Criteria II (Cont)

2B. Future Associated Airspace Encroachment (special use airspace)

MOAs and Restricted Airspace

GREEN - Future civil and commercial aviation development generally expected to remain compatible with existing military operating areas and restricted airspace
YELLOW - Future civil and commercial aviation development may impact access to some (limited) MOAs. Future development of MOAs or restricted airspace may be limited
RED - Future civil and commercial aviation may predominate the area and access to MOAs may become severely limited. Future development of MOAs or restricted airspace may be limited

Auxiliary Airfields

GREEN - Future regional development generally expected to be compatible with Auxiliary Airfield
YELLOW - Future regional development may become incompatible in some (limited) areas, creating some restrictions on access to Auxiliary Airfields
RED - Future regional development may become severely incompatible in many areas, causing major modifications to Auxiliary Airfield

Low Level Routes

GREEN - Future regional development generally expected to be compatible with low level route access
YELLOW - Future regional development may become incompatible in some (limited) areas, creating restrictions on low level route structure
RED - Future regional development may become severely incompatible in many areas, causing major modifications to low level routes

3. Facilities capacity:

Base

GREEN > or = to the mean
YELLOW > or = to -1 standard deviation and < the mean
RED < -1 standard deviation

Housing

GREEN > or = to the mean
YELLOW > or = to -1 standard deviation and < the mean
RED < -1 standard deviation

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

Criteria II (Cont)

4. Facilities condition:

Base

A. Condition

GREEN > or = to the mean
YELLOW > or = to -1 standard deviation and < the mean
RED < -1 standard deviation

B. Cost:

GREEN < or = to the mean
YELLOW > the mean and < or = to +1 standard deviation
RED > +1 standard deviation

Housing

A. Condition

GREEN > or = to the mean
YELLOW > or = to -1 standard deviation and < the mean
RED < -1 standard deviation

B. Cost:

GREEN < or = to the mean
YELLOW > the mean and < or = to +1 standard deviation
RED > +1 standard deviation

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

Criteria II (Cont)

5A. Existing local/regional community encroachment

Accident potential zones

GREEN - Off-base development generally compatible with accident potential zones and quantity-distance criteria

YELLOW - Off-base development incompatible in some (limited) areas construction/operations

RED - Off-base development incompatible with accident potential zones, or quantity-distance safety criteria

Noise zones

GREEN - Off-base development generally compatible with Air Installation Compatible Use Zone noise recommendations

YELLOW - Off-base development incompatible in some (limited) areas

RED - Off-base development incompatible in many areas, or many people exposed to high noise levels

Environs airspace

GREEN - Airspace encroachment is low and little or no operational adjustments made

YELLOW - Airspace encroachment is moderate and may require limited operational adjustments

RED - Airspace encroachment is high and requires substantial operational adjustment

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

Criteria II (Cont)

5B. Future local/regional community encroachment

Accident potential zones

GREEN - Future off-base development generally expected to remain compatible with accident potential zones and quantity-distance criteria

YELLOW - Future off-base development may become incompatible in some (limited) areas

RED - Future off-base development may become incompatible with accident potential zones, or quantity-distance safety criteria

Noise zones

GREEN - Future off-base development generally expected to be compatible with Air Installation Compatible Use Zone noise recommendations

YELLOW - Future off-base development may become incompatible in some (limited) areas

RED - Future off-base development may become incompatible in many areas, or many people exposed to high noise levels

Environs airspace

GREEN - Potential for encroachment is low and little or no operational adjustment anticipated

YELLOW - Potential for encroachment is moderate and may require limited operational adjustment

RED - Potential for encroachment is high and may require substantial operational adjustments

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

II. AVAILABILITY AND CONDITION OF LAND, FACILITIES, AND ASSOCIATED AIRSPACE AT BOTH THE EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING LOCATIONS

1. Are there unique facilities at the installation which must be replicated if the base is closed? (High cost specialized facilities)

GREEN - Yes, unique facilities exists
RED - No, unique facilities exists

UNIQUE FACILITIES

COLUMBUS	R
LAUGHLIN	R
REESE	R
VANCE	R
WILLIAMS	G

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

FLYING CATEGORY

TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

II. THE AVAILABILITY AND CONDITION OF LAND, FACILITIES AND ASSOCIATED AIRSPACE AT BOTH THE EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING LOCATIONS

2. Existing Associated Airspace Encroachment (Special Use Airspace)

2.A Existing Local/Regional Community Encroachment

	MOAs/RA	AUX AIRFIELD	LOW LEVEL
COLUMBUS	G	G	G
LAUGHLIN	G	G	G
REESE	G	G	G
VANCE	G	G	G
WILLIAMS	Y	Y	G

GREEN - Civil and commercial aviation development generally compatible with existing Military Operating Areas and Restricted Airspace

YELLOW - Civil and commercial aviation development impacts access to some (limited) MOAs. Near term development of MOAs or Restricted Airspace may be limited.

RED - Civil and commercial aviation dominates the development of and access to MOAs. Near-term development of MOAs or Restricted Airspace incompatible

GREEN - Regional development generally compatible with access to Auxiliary Airfield activity

YELLOW - Regional development incompatible in some (limited) areas, creating restrictions on Auxiliary Airfield activities

RED - Regional development severely incompatible in many areas, causing major modifications to Auxiliary Airfield access, or severely limits access to MOAs

GREEN - Regional development generally compatible with low-level route access

YELLOW - Regional development incompatible in some (limited) areas, creating restrictions on low level route structure

RED - Regional development severely incompatible in many areas, causing major modifications to low level routes

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

II. THE AVAILABILITY AND CONDITION OF LAND, FACILITIES AND ASSOCIATED AIRSPACE FOR BOTH THE EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING LOCATIONS

2. Associated Airspace Encroachment (Special Use Airspace)

2.B Future Local/Regional Community Encroachment

	MOAs/RA	AUX AIRFIELD	LOW LEVEL
COLUMBUS	Y	G	G
LAUGHLIN	G	G	G
REESE	G	G	G
VANCE	G	G	G
WILLIAMS	R	Y	Y

GREEN - Future civil and commercial aviation development generally expected to remain compatible with existing Military Operating Areas and Restricted Airspace

YELLOW - Future civil and commercial aviation development may impact access to some (limited) MOAs. Future development of Restricted Airspace may be limited.

RED - Future civil and commercial aviation may predominate the area and access to MOAs may become severely limited. Future development of Restricted Airspace incompatible

GREEN - Future regional development generally expected to be compatible with access to Air-to-Ground ranges

YELLOW - Future regional development may become incompatible in some (limited) areas, creating restrictions on access to Air-to-Ground ranges

RED - Future regional development may become severely incompatible in many areas, causing major modifications to Air-to-Ground range access

GREEN - Future regional development generally expected to be compatible with low-level route access

YELLOW - Future regional development may become incompatible in some (limited) areas, creating restrictions on low level route structure

RED - Future regional development may become severely incompatible in many areas, causing major modifications to low level routes

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

FLYING CATEGORY

TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

II. AVAILABILITY AND CONDITION OF LAND, FACILITIES, AND ASSOCIATED AIRSPACE AT BOTH THE EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING LOCATIONS

3. Facilities capacity:

Base

GREEN > or = to the mean
 YELLOW > or = to -1 standard deviation and < the mean
 RED < -1 standard deviation

Housing

GREEN > or = to the mean
 YELLOW > or = to -1 standard deviation and < the mean
 RED < -1 standard deviation

4. Facilities condition:

Base

A. Condition

GREEN > or = to the mean
 YELLOW > or = to -1 standard deviation and < the mean
 RED < -1 standard deviation

B. Cost:

GREEN < or = to the mean
 YELLOW > the mean and < or = to +1 standard deviation
 RED > +1 standard deviation

Housing

A. Condition

GREEN > or = to the mean
 YELLOW > or = to -1 standard deviation and < the mean
 RED < -1 standard deviation

B. Cost:

GREEN < or = to the mean
 YELLOW > the mean and < or = to +1 standard deviation
 RED > +1 standard deviation

	CAPACITY Base/Housing		CONDITION Base/Housing		COST Base/Housing	
COLUMBUS	G	G	Y	R	G	R
LAUGHLIN	G	G	G	Y	G	Y
REESE	Y	Y	G	G	G	G
VANCE	R	R	G	G	G	G
WILLIAMS	G	G	R	G	R	G

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

II. THE AVAILABILITY AND CONDITION OF LAND, FACILITIES, AND ASSOCIATED AIRSPACE AT BOTH THE EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING LOCATIONS
5.A Existing Local/Regional Community Encroachment

	APZ	NOISE	ENVIRONS AIRSPACE
COLUMBUS	G	G	G
LAUGHLIN	G	G	G
REESE	G	G	G
VANCE	Y	Y	G
WILLIAMS	G	G	Y
GREEN - Off-base development generally compatible with accident potential zones and quantity-distance criteria YELLOW - Off-base development incompatible in some (limited) areas construction/operations. RED - Off-base development incompatible with accident potential zones, or quantity-distance safety criteria		GREEN - Off-base development generally compatible with Air Installation Compatible Use Zone noise recommendations YELLOW - Off-base development incompatible in some (limited) areas RED - Off-base development incompatible in many areas, or many people exposed to high noise levels	
		GREEN - Airspace encroachment is LOW and little or no operational adjustments made YELLOW - Airspace encroachment is moderate and may require limited operational adjustments RED - Airspace encroachment is high and requires substantial operational adjustment	

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

FLYING CATEGORY

TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

II. THE AVAILABILITY AND CONDITION OF LAND, FACILITIES, AND ASSOCIATED AIRSPACE AT BOTH THE EXISTING AND RECEIVING LOCATIONS

5.B Future Local/Regional Community Encroachment

	APZ	NOISE	ENVIRONS AIRSPACE
COLUMBUS	G	G	G
LAUGHLIN	G	G	G
REESE	G	G	G
VANCE	Y	Y	G
WILLIAMS	G	G	Y

GREEN - Future off-base development generally expected to remain compatible with accident potential zones and quantity-distance criteria.

YELLOW - Future off-base development may become incompatible in some (limited) areas construction/operations.

RED - Future off-base development may become incompatible with accident potential zones, or quantity-distance safety criteria

GREEN - Future off-base development generally expected to be compatible with Air Installation Compatible Use Zone noise recommendations

YELLOW - Future off-base development may become incompatible in some (limited) areas

RED - Future off-base development may become incompatible in many areas, or many people exposed to high noise levels

GREEN - Potential for encroachment is **LOW** and little or no operational adjustments anticipated

YELLOW - Potential for encroachment is moderate and may require limited operational adjustments

RED - Potential for encroachment is high and may require substantial operational adjustments

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLAS FIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

II. AVAILABILITY AND CONDITION OF LAND, FACILITIES, AND ASSOCIATED AIRSPACE AT BOTH THE EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING LOCATIONS

		EAE			FAE			Cap		Cost		Cost			ECOM			FCOM		
	Unique Facilities	MOAs & Rest Auxiliary Airfields			MOAs & Rest Aux Airfield			Base Facilities Family Housing		Base Facilities Family Housing		Base Facilities Family Housing			AFZs Noise Environ			AFZs Noise Environ		
		LL Rtes			LL Rtes															
COLUMBUS	R	G	G	G	Y	G	G	G	G	Y	R	G	R		G	G	G	G	G	G
LAUGHLIN	R	G	G	G	G	G	G	G	G	G	Y	G	Y		G	G	G	G	G	G
REESE	R	G	G	G	G	G	G	Y	Y	G	G	G	G		G	G	G	G	G	G
VANCE	R	G	G	G	G	G	G	R	R	G	G	G	G		Y	Y	G	Y	Y	G
WILLIAMS	G	Y	Y	G	R	Y	Y	G	G	R	G	R	G		G	G	Y	G	G	Y

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

III. THE POTENTIAL TO ACCOMMODATE CONTINGENCY, MOBILIZATION, AND FUTURE FORCE REQUIREMENTS AS A RECEIVING LOCATION.

1. Contingency and Mobilization:

A. Ramp Space per C-141 MOG

GREEN - 5 or more
YELLOW - 3 to 4
RED - less than 3

B. Does the base have a fuel hydrant system?

GREEN - Yes, fully operational
YELLOW - Yes, perational but needs repairs
RED - No or inoperative

C. What is the munitions storage capacity?

GREEN - 30% or more excess N.E.W. capacity over current requirement
YELLOW - 10 to 29% excess capacity
RED - < 10% excess capacity

D. Does the base have a Hot Cargo Pad?

GREEN - Yes
RED - No

E. Geographic location.

Is the base located within 150 NM of:

(a) a major Army or Marine installation

GREEN - Yes
RED - No

(b) rail access

GREEN - Yes
RED - No

(c) a port facility

GREEN - Yes
RED - No

2. FUTURE FORCE REQUIREMENTS:

Is the base located and does it have basic necessary characteristics to support another category's mission?
(Assumes current mission is no longer present)

A. Mobility
B. Strategic
C. Tactical

GREEN - Yes, meets requirements of MACRO LOOK with minor or less MILCON
YELLOW - Yes, meets some requirements of MACRO LOOK with major MILCON
RED - Does not meet requirements of MACRO LOOK

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

III. THE POTENTIAL TO ACCOMMODATE CONTINGENCY, MOBILIZATION, AND FUTURE FORCE REQUIREMENTS AS A RECEIVING LOCATION.

1. Contingency and Mobilization

	MOGs	FUEL HYDRANT	MUNTIONS	H.C.P.	USA/USMC	RAIL	PORT
COLUMBUS	G	Y	G	G	R	G	R
LAUGHLIN	G	R	Y	G	R	G	R
REESE	G	R	R	G	R	G	R
VANCE	Y	R	Y	G	G	G	R
WILLIAMS	Y	R	G	G	R	G	R

MOGs - GREEN = 5 or more; YELLOW = 3 to 4; RED = < 3

Fuel Hydrant - GREEN = Yes, fully operational; YELLOW = Yes, but not fully operational; RED = No or inoperative

Muntions - GREEN = 30% or more excess N.E.W. capacity; YELLOW = 10 to 29% excess capacity; RED = < 10% excess capacity

H.C.P. (Hot Cargo Pad) - GREEN = Yes; RED = No

Is the base located within 150NM of a:

Major Army or Marine installation GREEN = Yes
RED = No

Rail Access GREEN = Yes
RED = No

Port GREEN = Yes
RED = No

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

FLYING CATEGORY

TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

III. THE POTENTIAL TO ACCOMMODATE CONTINGENCY, MOBILIZATION, AND FUTURE FORCE REQUIREMENTS AS A RECEIVING LOCATION.

2. FUTURE FORCE REQUIREMENTS:

Is the base located and does it have basic necessary characteristics to support another category's mission?
(Assumes current mission is no longer present)

		A. Mobility B. Strategic C. Tactical	GREEN - Yes, meets requirements of MACRO LOOK with minor or less MILCON YELLOW - Yes, meets some requirements of MACRO LOOK with major MILCON RED - Does not meet requirements of MACRO LOOK
	Mobility	Strategic	Tactical
COLUMBUS	G	G	G
LAUGHLIN	R	R	G
REESE	R	R	G
VANCE	R	R	G
WILLIAMS	R	R	G

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

III. THE POTENTIAL TO ACCOMMODATE CONTINGENCY, MOBILIZATION, AND FUTURE FORCE REQUIREMENTS AS A RECEIVING LOCATION.

	MOGs	FUEL HYD	MUNS	H.C.P.	USA/USMC	RAIL	PORT	MOB	STRAT	TACT
COLUMBUS	G	Y	G	G	R	G	R	G	G	G
LAUGHLIN	G	R	Y	G	R	G	R	R	R	G
REESE	G	R	R	G	R	G	R	R	R	G
VANCE	Y	R	Y	G	G	G	R	R	R	G
WILLIAMS	Y	R	G	G	R	G	R	R	R	G

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

III. THE POTENTIAL TO ACCOMMODATE CONTINGENCY, MOBILIZATION, AND FUTURE FORCE REQUIREMENTS AS A RECEIVING LOCATION.

	MOG _s	FUEL HYD	MUNS	H.C.P.	USA/USMC	RAIL	PORT	MOB	STRAT	TACT
COLUMBUS	G	Y	G	G	R	G	R	G	G	G
LAUGHLIN	G	R	Y	G	R	G	R	R	R	G
REESE	G	R	R	G	R	G	R	R	R	G
VANCE	Y	R	Y	G	G	G	R	R	R	G
WILLIAMS	Y	R	G	G	R	G	R	R	R	G

UNCLASSIFIED

**UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA**

IV. THE COST AND MANPOWER IMPLICATIONS

1. **ONE TIME CLOSURE COSTS:** Programming impact; excludes one-time environmental impact which is included in criteria #8.
2. **20 YEAR NET PRESENT VALUE (NPV) OF SAVINGS:** Shows savings (positive number) derived by discounting costs and savings over a 20 year period
3. **NET STEADY STATE SAVINGS:** The annual recurring savings which result from avoiding the operating and personnel costs of the closed base as offset by the annual recurring costs such as CHAMPUS and housing as a result of closing the base
4. **MANPOWER REDUCTIONS:** Support manpower spaces eliminated as a result of closing the base

V. THE EXTENT AND TIMING OF POTENTIAL COSTS AND SAVINGS, INCLUDING THE NUMBER OF YEARS, BEGINNING WITH THE DATE OF COMPLETION OF THE CLOSURE OR REALIGNMENT, FOR THE SAVINGS TO EXCEED THE COSTS.

1. **INVESTMENT PAYBACK:** Years elapsed from closure year to payback. Payback computed from Net Present Value analysis using OMB Circular A-94

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

**IV COST AND MANPOWER
IMPLICATIONS**

	ONE TIME CLOSURE COSTS (TY\$M)	(CY\$M)	20 YEAR NPV (\$M)	STEADY STATE NET SAVINGS	MANPOWER REDUCTIONS
COLUMBUS	19.1	17.5	274	38.7	865
LAUGHLIN	31.8	29.1	227	33.7	856
REESE	19.7	18.1	264	37.3	774
VANCE	14.2	13.0	215	30.1	307
WILLIAMS	27.4	24.9	242	37.2	905

**V RETURN ON
INVESTMENT**

**YEARS TO
PAYBACK**

1
1
1
1
1

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

LAND VALUE ANALYSIS - SUMMARY of FLYING TRAINING BASES

Criteria

	NPL	Rural	Small City	Urban	Overall	<u>Low Return (G-)</u>
COLUMBUS	R	G			G-	Columbus
LAUGHLIN	R	G			G-	Laughlin
REESE	R		Y		Y-	Vance
VANCE	R	G			G-	<u>Hard to sell; possible</u>
WILLIAMS	G			R	Y	<u>good return someday (Y)</u>
						Williams
						<u>Moderate return possible</u>
						<u>within six years (Y-)</u>
						Reese

Note: Air Force experience with closing bases led to the conclusion that the near term potential for revenue from property sales would be too uncertain to include it as a formal element in the cost analysis. However, this information was available to and considered by the BCEG in its deliberations.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VI. THE ECONOMIC IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES.

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. EMPLOYMENT | GREEN - Reductions exceed historic high reduction (1969-1987)
YELLOW - Reductions are between 50% of the historic high reduction and the historic high reduction (1969-1987)
RED - Reductions are less than 50% of historic high reduction (1969-1987), or negligible |
| 2. POPULATION | GREEN - Reductions exceed historic high reductions (1969-1987)
YELLOW - Reductions are between 50% of the historic high reduction and the historic high reduction (1969-1987)
RED - Reductions are less than 50% of the historic high reduction (1969-1987), or negligible |
| 3. INCOME | GREEN - Reductions exceed historic high reductions (1969-1987)
YELLOW - Reductions are between 50% of the historic high reduction and the historic high reduction
RED - Reductions are less than 50% of the historic high reduction (1969-1987), or negligible |
| 4. LOCAL GOVERNMENT
OPERATING REVENUES
EXPENDITURES | GREEN - The net fiscal impact on local government is negative and comparatively large.
(Expenditures savings are less than 75% of revenue losses)
YELLOW - The net fiscal impact on local government is negative, but comparatively small.
(Expenditures savings are 75% or more of revenue losses)
RED - The net fiscal impact on local government is neutral or positive. (Expenditures savings exceed revenue losses) |
| 5. INSTALLATION
RESTORATION
PROGRAMS (IRP) | GREEN - Actual clean-up time is estimated to be lengthy (> 5 yrs)
YELLOW - Actual clean-up time is moderate (about 5 yrs)
RED - Actual clean-up time is estimated to be relatively short (< 5 yrs) |

UNCLASSIFIED

**UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA**

VI. ECONOMIC IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES

EMPLOYMENT (crit. 1)

**COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS**

**G
G
Y
G
R**

GREEN - Reductions exceed historic high reduction (1969-1987)
YELLOW - Reductions are between 50% of the historic high reduction and the historic high reduction (1969-1987)
RED - Reductions are less than 50% of historic high reduction (1969-1987), or negligible

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VI. ECONOMIC IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES

POPULATION (crit. 2)

**COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS**

**G
G
G
G
R**

GREEN - Reductions exceed historic high reduction (1969-1987)

YELLOW - Reductions are between 50% of the historic high reduction and the historic high reduction (1969-1987)

RED - Reductions are less than 50% of historic high reduction (1969-1987), or negligible

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VI. ECONOMIC IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES

INCOME (crit. 3)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

G
G
Y
G
R

GREEN - Reductions exceed historic high reduction (1969-1987)

YELLOW - Reductions are between 50% of the historic high reduction and the historic high reduction (1969-1987)

RED - Reductions are less than 50% of historic high reduction (1969-1987), or negligible

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VI. ECONOMIC IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES

LOCAL GOVERNMENT OPERATING REVENUES/EXPENDITURES (crit. 4)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

G
G
G
G
G

GREEN - The net fiscal impact on local government is negative and comparatively large. (Expenditures savings are less than 75% of revenue losses.)

YELLOW - The net fiscal impact on local government is negative, but comparatively small. (Expenditures savings are 75% or more of revenue losses.)

RED - The net fiscal impact on local government is neutral or positive. (Expenditures savings exceed revenue losses.)

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VI. ECONOMIC IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES

INSTALLATION RESTORATION PROGRAMS (IRP) (crit. 5)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

Y
R
Y
G
G

GREEN - Actual clean-up time is estimated to be lengthy (greater than 5 years).
YELLOW - Actual clean-up time is estimated to be moderate (about 5 years).
RED - Actual clean-up time is estimated to be relatively short (within 5 years).

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VI. THE ECONOMIC IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES.

	EMPLOYMENT	POPULATION	INCOME	LOCAL GOVERNMENT OPERATING REVENUES /EXPENDITURES	IRP
COLUMBUS	G	G	G	G	Y
LAUGHLIN	G	G	G	G	R
REESE	Y	G	Y	G	Y
VANCE	G	G	G	G	G
WILLIAMS	R	R	R	G	G

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VII. THE ABILITY OF BOTH EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING COMMUNITIES INFRASTRUCTURE TO SUPPORT FORCES, MISSIONS, AND PERSONNEL.

1. Community Infrastructure

- | | |
|--|--|
| A. Affordable, acceptable off base housing | GREEN - Yes; RED - No |
| B. Base served by public transportation | GREEN - Yes; RED - No |
| C. Adequate off base recreation facilities | GREEN - Yes; RED - No |
| D. Adequate shopping facilities | GREEN - 20 miles or less; RED - > 20 miles |

2. Education

- | | |
|--|--|
| A. Pupil to Teacher Ratio
(Max allowable ratio) | GREEN - ≤ 25 to 1
YELLOW - 26 - 30 to 1
RED - > 30 to 1 |
| B. Students that go on to college | GREEN - $\geq 60\%$
YELLOW - 40% to 59%
RED - < 40% |
| C. Opportunity for off base education | GREEN - Under/Grad courses within 25 miles
YELLOW - Less course opportunity within 25 miles
RED - No education opportunity within 25 miles |

3. Availability of community medical facilities

- | |
|-------------------------------------|
| GREEN - Adequate, no adverse impact |
| YELLOW - Available, minimal impact |
| RED - Medically underserved |

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VII. THE ABILITY OF BOTH EXISTING AND POTENTIAL RECEIVING COMMUNITIES INFRASTRUCTURE TO SUPPORT FORCES, MISSIONS, AND PERSONNEL.

	HOUS	TRANS	REC	SHOP	RATIO	COLLEGE	EDUCATION	MEDICAL
COLUMBUS	G	R	G	G	R	G	G	G
LAUGHLIN	G	G	G	G	Y	Y	G	Y
REESE	G	R	G	G	G	*	G	G
VANCE	G	G	G	G	Y	G	G	G
WILLIAMS	G	R	G	G	R	Y	G	G

* Not Tracked

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT.

(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

- 1. AIR QUALITY**
GREEN - Base is in attainment for all pollutants. No restrictions on construction/operations.
YELLOW - Base is in non-attainment area. No restrictions on construction/operations.
RED - Base is in non-attainment area and construction/operations constraints apply.
- 2. WATER**
GREEN - Adequate regional water supplies and no known contaminants present
YELLOW - Suspect regional water supplies; contaminants present within a non-potable water zone
RED - Inadequate regional water supplies and/or region within a state of over draft and/or contaminants detected within potable water sources
- 3. HAZARDOUS MATERIAL - SOLID/HAZARDOUS WASTE**
 - A. Asbestos**
GREEN - < 10% facilities with asbestos containing materials (ACM)
YELLOW - > 10% and < 25% facilities with ACM; survey incomplete. unable to assess percentages
RED - > 25% facilities containing ACM
 - B. Radon**
GREEN - Radon not present or detected < 4 pic/l
YELLOW - Radon present; detection > 4 pic/l & < 20 pic/l
RED - Radon present; detection > 20 pic/l
 - C. Solid Waste**
GREEN - Existing regional disposal facilities have > 10 years capacity remaining
YELLOW - Existing regional disposal facilities have 5 to 10 years capacity remaining
RED - Existing regional disposal facilities have < 5 years capacity remaining

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT.
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

4. BIOLOGICAL

A. Habitat

GREEN - Resources not present

YELLOW - Resources present which do not currently constrain construction/operations

RED - Resources present which constrain current construction/operations or require "work arounds" to support current operation

B. Threatened and Endangered Species (T&E) G/Y/R (same as habitat)

C. Wetlands G/Y/R (same as habitat)

5. CULTURAL

GREEN - No existing resources

YELLOW - Historic or ineligible prehistoric resources are present, but do not currently constrain construction/operations, or base survey incomplete

RED - Eligible or potentially eligible prehistoric resources are present and constrain current construction/operations

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT.
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

6. GEOLOGY AND SOILS

**A. Prime and unique
farmlands**

GREEN - No prime and unique farmlands exist
YELLOW - Prime and unique farmlands exist; resources compatible with current
construction/operations
RED - Prime and unique farmlands exist; large areas; resources incompatible with current
construction/operations

**B. Mineral/Energy
Resources**

GREEN - No known resources
YELLOW - Resources currently exist; no known constraint on current construction/operations
RED - Resources currently exist and constrain on current construction/operations

C. Soil Contamination

GREEN - No soil contaminants present
YELLOW - Soil contaminants present which do not currently constrain construction/operations
RED - Soil contaminants present which constrain current construction/operations

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

AIR QUALITY (crit. 1)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

G
G
G
G
R

GREEN - Base is in attainment for all pollutants. No restrictions on construction/operations.
YELLOW - Base is in non-attainment area. No restrictions on construction/operations.
RED - Base is in non-attainment area and construction/operations constraints apply.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

WATER (crit. 2)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

Y
Y
R
Y
R

GREEN - Adequate regional water supplies and no known contaminants present.

YELLOW - Suspect regional water supplies; contaminants present within a non-potable water zone.

RED - Inadequate regional water supplies and/or region within a state of over draft and/or contaminants detected within potable water sources.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

HAZARDOUS MATERIAL -- SOLID/HAZARDOUS WASTE

ASBESTOS (crit. 3a)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

Y
R
Y
Y
R

GREEN - < 10% facilities with asbestos containing materials (ACM)
YELLOW - > 10% and < 25% facilities with ACM; survey incomplete; unable to assess percentages
RED - > 25% facilities containing ACM

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

HAZARDOUS MATERIAL -- SOLID/HAZARDOUS WASTE

RADON (crit. 3b)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

Y
G
G
Y
Y

GREEN - Radon not present or detected < 4 pic/l
YELLOW - Radon present; detection > 4 pic/l and < 20 pic/l
RED - Radon present; detection > 20 pic/l

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

HAZARDOUS MATERIAL -- SOLID/HAZARDOUS WASTE

SOLID WASTE (crit. 3c)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

G
G
Y
G
G

GREEN - Existing regional disposal facilities have >10 years capacity remaining

YELLOW - Existing regional disposal facilities have 5 to 10 years capacity remaining

RED - Existing regional disposal facilities have <5 years capacity remaining

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

FLYING CATEGORY

TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

BIOLOGICAL

	HABITAT (crit. 4a)	THREATENED AND ENDANGERED SPECIES (crit. 4b)	WETLANDS (crit. 4c)
COLUMBUS	Y	Y	G
LAUGHLIN	Y	G	Y
REESE	G	G	G
VANCE	G	G	Y
WILLIAMS	G	G	G

GREEN - Resources not present.

YELLOW - Resources present which do not currently constrain construction/operations.

RED - Resources present which constrain current construction/operations or require "work arounds" to support current operations.

GREEN - (Same as for Habitat)

YELLOW - (Same as for Habitat)

RED - (Same as for Habitat)

GREEN - (Same as for Habitat)

YELLOW - (Same as for Habitat)

RED - (Same as for Habitat)

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

CULTURAL RESOURCES (crit. 5)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

Y
G
G
Y
R

GREEN - No existing resources.

YELLOW - Historic or ineligible prehistoric resources are present, but do not currently constrain construction/operations, or base survey incomplete.

RED - Eligible or potentially eligible prehistoric resources are present and constrain current construction/operations.

UNCLASSIFIED

**UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA**

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

GEOLOGY AND SOILS

PRIME AND UNIQUE FARMLANDS (crit. 6a)

COLUMBUS	G
LAUGHLIN	G
REESE	G
VANCE	Y
WILLIAMS	G

GREEN - No prime and unique farmlands exist.

YELLOW - Prime and unique farmlands exist; resources compatible with current construction/operations.

RED - Prime and unique farmlands exist; large areas; resources incompatible with current construction/operations.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCL. SIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

GEOLOGY AND SOILS

MINERAL/ENERGY RESOURCES (crit. 6b)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

Y
G
G
Y
G

GREEN - No known resources.

YELLOW - Resources currently exist; no known constraint on current construction/operations.

RED - Resources currently exist and constrain current construction/operations.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
FLYING CATEGORY
TRAINING SUBCATEGORY CRITERIA

VIII. THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
(Assessment of existing conditions for decision making)

GEOLOGY AND SOILS

SOIL CONTAMINATION (crit. 6c)

COLUMBUS
LAUGHLIN
REESE
VANCE
WILLIAMS

Y
G
Y
Y
Y

GREEN - No soil contaminants present.

YELLOW - Soil contaminants present which do not currently constrain construction/operations.

RED - Soil contaminants present which constrain current construction/operations.

UNCLASSIFIED